

MINUTES

HARRISBURG ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD REGULAR MEETING

July 6, 2009

**THE MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR. CITY GOVERNMENT CENTER
PUBLIC SAFETY AUDITORIUM, ROOM 213**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kristen McKissick, Chair
Art Emerick, Asst. Codes Administrator
Bill Fontana
Dudley Smith

STAFF PRESENT: Candace H. Stowell, Deputy Director
Craig D. Peiffer, Urban Planner

OTHERS PRESENT: See attached attendance signature sheet.

CALL TO ORDER: 6:00 P.M.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Mr. Emerick moved and Mr. Smith seconded the motion to approve the minutes of the June 1, 2009 meeting as presented. The Board approved the motion by a vote of 4-0.

NEW BUSINESS:

1 204 Verbeke Street to install a gable roof on the rear half of the building and brick in a missing window

Mr. Peiffer gave a synopsis of the case report, recommending approval with conditions.

The case was represented by Herbert Thomas, 1007 Chippenham Road, Mechanicsburg, PA.

Ms. McKissick inquired if the applicant had any questions pertaining to the condition for approval. Mr. Thomas replied that he proposed to construct the roof with two gable ends, and referenced photos provided in his application, citing only one other roof on Sayford Street was hipped, and other styles included flat and sloped. He added that he intended to clean the Sayford Street facade and paint the existing doors and frames.

Ms. McKissick inquired where the proposed roof would be visible from Verbeke Street. Mr. Thomas replied that only a small portion would be visible when viewed down the

pedestrian alley between 204 and 206 Verbeke Street. He clarified citing an image in the application that the roof would be located approximately six feet behind a railing providing access to an upper floor apartment.

Mr. Smith inquired why the applicant proposed a gable roof. Mr. Thomas replied the existing flat roof was so deteriorated that it would require full removal and reconstruction, and that he had the experience to build a gable roof.

Mr. Emerick stated he felt Sayford Street was more of a tertiary street, where alterations to the building form were less obtrusive to the historic form and subsequent character. He added that the hip would require additional gutter along the Sayford Street facade. Ms McKissick noted that a 4:12 slope provided a shallow pitch which may not be as noticeable. She added a hipped roof may be as foreign as a vinyl-sided gable end.

Mr. Fontana asked if staff were more concerned with the use of vinyl siding then the roof form. Mr. Peiffer replied the condition for a hip roof was more specifically related to compliance with the Standards, whereas exterior alteration shall require minimal change to distinctive spatial relationships that characterize the property. He clarified that a hip roof would be less noticeable from the right-of-way, i.e. sloping away from the building's facade, than a gable end extending vertically from the building's facade.

Mr. Fontana suggested he would be amenable to the gable end if the vinyl were replaced with an alternative material in compliance with HARB Guidelines, suggesting cement board. Ms. McKissick concurred adding the color shall be selected from a darker palette, and the cement board installed with the smooth surface facing out. Mr. Fontana then inquired if the applicant would be amenable to HARB's recommendation; Mr. Thomas agreed to the use of cement board.

Mr. Smith moved and Mr. Emerick seconded the motion to approve the amended request. The Board approved the motion by a vote of 4-0.

2 427 Boas Street to install concrete steps to an English basement and privacy fence in the rear yard

Mr. Peiffer gave a synopsis of the case report, recommending approval.

The case was represented by Justin Bennage, 707 Cocklin Street, Mechanicsburg, PA.

Ms. McKissick called for comments from the public.

Greg Hutchison, 429 Boas Street, cited the 2005 Resolution, Item 6, and stated the applicant had removed the masonry wall separating the rear porch from the adjacent property; however, the wall was reconstructed as wood frame, and was left unfinished (exposed OSB) facing his property. He acknowledged he had spoken with the contractors, who had indicated their intent to finish the wall; however, he expressed

concern as the wall remained unfinished (Ref. photos provided by Mr. Hutchison). Mr. Bennage replied that the contractors were scheduled to return to install wood clapboard on the opposite side the rear porch, and pending Mr. Hutchison's approval, he would have them finish the adjacent side using the same material. Mr. Hutchison concurred with the solution.

Ted Hanson, 434 Boas Street, stated he originally rehabilitated 429 Boas Street, and used the subject property's English basement door as reference for replicating the details. He clarified that the original door had two base panels with two upper lites, and that the door he fabricated replaced the upper lites with solid panels. He then identified that the applicant had removed the original door and replaced it with a non-historic door (Ref. photos provided by Mr. Hanson). He added that the applicant should also be required to install a French Drain and remove the tripping hazard (threshold) at the English Basement entry. Mr. Fontana inquired when the door was replaced. Mr. Hanson replied as part of this work. Ms. McKissick asked if the applicant still had the original door. Mr. Bennage replied that he did not believe the door was kept, and added that the door had been replaced for approximately several months. Ms. McKissick suggested the scope of work be amended to include the English Basement door. The HARB Members concurred with her recommendation.

Ms. McKissick inquired if the applicant would be amenable to replacing the door. Mr. Bennage replied yes if that was what would be required for approval. Mr. Peiffer clarified that the HARB would need to draft their motion as an approval with conditions. He then asked Mr. Hanson if he would provide the applicant with the documents he used to replicate the door; Mr. Hanson agreed.

Mr. Fontana moved that the application be approved with the amendment that an appropriate four panel, exterior door, be fabricated to match the style of the adjacent door at 429 Boas Street for the English Basement entry. Ms. McKissick added that Mr. Hanson was requested to provide Staff with the door specifications.

Mr. Fontana moved and Mr. Emerick seconded the motion to approve the request with additional conditions. The Board approved the motion by a vote of 4-0.

3 118 Calder Street to install a 12' x 10' deck on the second story roof at the rear of the house

Mr. Peiffer gave a synopsis of the case report, recommending approval with conditions.

The case was represented by Gary Wilson, 111 West Main Street, Lebanon, PA.

There were no questions from the HARB Members or the public, and Mr. Wilson stated that he was in agreement with the condition for approval.

Mr. Fontana moved and Mr. Smith seconded the motion to approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report. The Board approved the motion by a vote of 4-0.

4 400 North Second Street to install a new sign

Mr. Peiffer gave a synopsis of the case report, recommending approval with conditions.

The case was represented by Rick Galiardo, 2920 Green Street, Harrisburg, PA.

Ms. McKissick inquired if the applicant had any questions pertaining to the condition for approval. Mr. Galiardo provided clarification on the sign dimensions. He stated the application indicates 26" x 68", the temporary sign is 37" x 97", and he would like to construct the permanent sign at 41" x 110". He added that he would also be amenable to the permanent sign being constructed at the same size as the temporary sign. Mr. Fontana inquired and Mr. Galiardo confirmed that 37 inches was from the bottom of the sign to the tip of the pharaohs' crown. Ms. McKissick stated that the lettering size should fit within the marquee, and therefore the temporary sign size was acceptable.

Mr. Galiardo then addressed the second condition for approval, stating he is requesting the plastic finish, as it is easily molded to fit the curvilinear form of the marquee. He stated he could construct the sign using a "traditional material," but added there was an increase in cost. Mr. Smith inquired and Mr. Galiardo agreed that metal would be an acceptable alternative.

Mr. Smith moved and Mr. Fontana seconded the motion to approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report. The Board approved the motion by a vote of 4-0.

OTHER BUSINESS:

Craig Peiffer provided an update on the two proposed municipal historic districts and advised that Planning Bureau Staff would hold an informational meeting for property owners within the Academy Manor Neighborhood on July 15th, beginning at 6:00 pm at Lakeside Lutheran Church. He briefly reviewed the items to be discussed and handouts to be provided. It was suggested that Mr. Peiffer issue to the HARB a copy of the agenda and HARB FAQ.

ADJOURNMENT:

Mr. Fontana moved and Mr. Emerick seconded the motion to adjourn. The motion was adopted by unanimous vote and the meeting adjourned at 7:08 P.M.